

CONSULTATION AND PARTICIPATION REPORT

1. BACKGROUND

The West Yorkshire Local Transport Plan partners have individually undertaken much public consultation on their separate transport strategies and associated 'Package' programmes, which have been under development since the early 1990s. This consultation included specially convened public meetings, the distribution of publicity leaflets including questionnaires and presentations to groups and organisations.

When, in 1996, the five West Yorkshire districts and Metro agreed formally to publish a joint 'Package' bid for 1997/98, renewed effort was put into consultation. This was mainly by repetition of the tried formats of earlier years.

There was a feeling amongst the partners that the methods of consultation employed might not be reaching all sectors of the community or enough people to be truly representative. Neither was it felt to allow for genuine public participation or involvement in the development of strategies, policies and priorities.

The introduction of the Local Transport Plan regime for the bid year 1999/2000, together with encouragement given in the Government's LTP guidance in this respect, gave the opportunity for a comprehensive review of consultation and participation strategy.

2. PURPOSE OF CONSULTATION

The consultation and participation strategy has been designed to perform several functions; namely to provide information, to undertake consultation and to achieve participation. The programme covers both the broad principles of the transport strategy and the priorities for its delivery and, in varying levels of detail, the scheme content of the implementation programmes. These principles have been applied to the preparation of the provisional Plan, through the development of the full Plan for submission in July 2000, and will continue through the life of the five-year Plan.

The various objectives can be summarised as follows:

- to impart information about the LTP to as wide an audience as possible. This is essentially a one-way process in which information is disseminated from the authority to the public (This is an important complement to consultation, in that people cannot be expected to respond meaningfully to consultation without first being in possession of the relevant facts);
- to obtain views on the development of the various aspects of the strategy and the relative priority/emphasis given to each;
- to obtain views on the style and coverage of the submission;
- to enable the public to have a direct influence on the preparation of the Plan;
- to foster an understanding between different user groups of each others' transport needs;
- to generate a sense of ownership of the Plan.

3. METHODS USED

A number of different methods were employed, each having a slightly different aim, but complementing one another to produce a balanced, comprehensive programme of

consultation and participation. The methods used and a detailed description of the methodology are set out below.

3.1 Brochure and Questionnaire

A professionally produced colour brochure, presenting a summary of the key points of the LTP strategy and programmes, was widely distributed. It included a questionnaire on a prepaid postal form. (A copy is attached as Appendix 1)

Aims

- To inform the widest possible audience about the LTP and to obtain opinions from a large number of people.

In the past, similar brochures have achieved only a limited response due partly to the passive methods used for distribution. This time, in addition to the passive methods, the brochure was given out to targeted transport user groups in order to ensure that no group was inadvertently ignored.

Methodology

A full colour brochure, approximately A2 folded to A5 size, was produced. It summarised the content of the provisional LTP, including the vision and challenge, the four key elements of the transport strategy, a brief description of key scheme proposals and a breakdown of proposed expenditure by type of scheme/transport user beneficiary. Also included was a questionnaire on attitudes to a variety of aspects of transport for return by a freepost address.

16,000 brochures were printed initially. They were distributed through a number of outlets designed to reach a wide and varied audience. Brochures were left in Council buildings such as libraries, housing offices and other offices where the public have access and were invited to pick up the brochures. They were also left in health centres/surgeries and handed out at bus and rail stations. Copies were sent to schools and, to reach people who were more likely to be car borne, they were left in sports centres and handed out at selected supermarkets in each district.

In each district, apart from Calderdale, brochures were sent to the major businesses and employers. In Calderdale, an established network of business consultees was used to distribute 180 slightly amended questionnaires. In addition to this brochures were sent out to specific interest organisations who had requested them. Care was taken to keep this approach to a minimum to avoid skewing the results towards one area of interest. In the event this was not a problem as the numbers were relatively small compared to the overall number of replies received.

A further 12,000 brochures were printed and distributed extensively at supermarkets in the Leeds area and sent out to small businesses in Leeds District.

Results

A total of 2006 completed questionnaires were received, which represents a rate of nearly 7.4% of the 28,000 total brochures distributed. From past experience, this represents a successful outcome to the consultation. In fact the response to the first batch of 16,000 brochures was even better, approaching 10%. A further 81 replies were received from the Calderdale business consultation, a 45% response rate.

A summary of the responses is given in Section 4 and in Appendices 2 and 3.

3.2 Internet Website

This is an increasingly popular medium allowing an almost limitless amount of data to be made available, and which can be updated on a regular basis.

Aims

- To provide as much of the developing Local Transport Plan and supporting information in electronic format as possible for the benefit of those who have access to a computer.

Methodology

A website address (www.westyorkshire-ltp.co.uk) has been set up on which has been placed the text of the provisional Local Transport Plan with links to other useful sites. The site has been updated as development of the full Plan has progressed. Also posted on the site is the brochure and questionnaire, which can be completed and returned on-line.

Results

75 questionnaires were returned by this method. The data has been incorporated into the analysis of the postal returns reported in Section 4.

3.3 Seminars

A programme of seminars was held for invited specific interest and community groups and business representatives on a countywide basis. The interest and community group seminars were also advertised for the general public.

Aims

- To ensure that the views of specific transport user representative groups were obtained;
- to ensure that representatives from different sectors of industry, business and commerce had an input into the LTP, both as users and providers;
- to give the opportunity for direct, two way contact between the public and officers preparing the LTP.

Methodology

A number of seminars have been held as follows:

17 April 1999 Interest and Community Group Seminar

The seminar was held in Leeds Town Hall on a Saturday morning and comprised an invited group of both district and county-based representatives of interest, community and transport user groups. It was also open to the general public. The meeting discussed the policy and strategy issues to be covered in the provisional LTP.

15 June 1999 Business Seminar

The half-day seminar was held at an hotel in Leeds and comprised an invited group of representatives of the main businesses and business organisations district and countywide. The meeting discussed transport issues that were of particular relevance to businesses.

23 October 1999 Interest and Community Group Seminar

This seminar was organised on a similar format to the 17 April seminar. The same

groups and organisations were invited, plus any other groups subsequently identified, to discuss the provisional LTP as it was submitted with a view to steering the development of the full plan.

15 April 2000 Interest and Community Group Seminar

This was a further meeting of interest and community groups to discuss an early draft of the full LTP.

Results

Attendance at the Interest and Community Group Seminars was approximately 60 to 70 delegates on each occasion.

Notes of each meeting were written up and contained strong themes which were common to the various workshop groups that comprised the meetings. A summary of the main issues raised at the seminars is included in Section 4.

3.4 Public Meetings

A number of special public meetings were held, or presentations made at interest group meetings.

Aims

- To publicise the LTP strategy and enable participation at a more local level and to consolidate the views of the seminar group representatives.

Methodology

A variety of meetings were held in each district, either called specially or by way of a presentation made to already scheduled meetings

January / February 2000 Chambers of Commerce

Presentations were made to meetings of the Chambers of Commerce in each district except Bradford. Members were asked to return their comments, preferably on the consultation brochure questionnaires.

Other Meetings

| | |
|------------|---|
| Bradford | Addingham, Oxenhope and Silsden Parish Councils 45 Neighbourhood Forums |
| Calderdale | The Standing Conference of Women's Organisations The Rights of Way Sub Committee The Environmental Forum – Transport Focus Group |
| Kirklees | Holme Valley Parish Council Kirklees Cycling Public Meeting |
| Leeds | Leeds Cycling Consultation Meeting Leeds North and Roundhay Community Forum Morley Community Partnership South Gipton Community Forum Chapel Allerton Project |

| | |
|-----------|---|
| | Leeds Civic Trust |
| | Barclays Home Finance Lunchtime Employees Meeting |
| | Seminar for Leeds Councillors |
| | Pedestrians Association |
| Wakefield | Transport and Health Seminar |
| | Community Assembly Conference |
| Metro | District based Passenger Consultative Committees (several presentations in each district) |

Results

All the meetings of established groups were well attended by regular group members. The Neighbourhood Forums held in Bradford were specifically aimed to attract the residents in each locality and attendance varied, apparently influenced by what other issues of local interest were on the agenda. It is estimated that, in total, over one thousand people will have attended the meetings.

3.5 Market Research - Focus Groups

Specialist market research consultants were employed to conduct focus group sessions with selected groups of transport users. The selection ensured that representative samples of the population according to agreed criteria were involved.

Aims

To draw out issues that are of concern to people in order to guide and inform the design of a wide ranging questionnaire for use in the resident's survey.

Methodology

Thirteen focus groups were held with different sectors of the population across different areas as follows:

1. Rural dwellers (2 groups)
2. Urban dwellers (2 groups)
3. Car users (2 groups)
4. Non car users (2 groups)
5. Young people aged 16 to 18
6. Elderly aged 70+
7. Social class DE
8. Business owners/managers
9. Disabled People

The groups were held in Bradford, Halifax, Huddersfield, Wakefield and Leeds. The composition and location of the groups were carefully selected to obtain views, as far as possible, from a representative cross section of the community with different interests, experiences and priorities concerning transport.

The partners and Consultants, MVA, developed a topic guide for the focus groups and

MVA's social research staff moderated and recorded each session for subsequent analysis. Those analyses were used to guide and inform the design of the questionnaire for the main survey, as well as for inclusion in the Market Research report.

Results

The output from the Focus Groups was fed directly into the design of the residents survey questionnaire.

3.6 Market Research - Residents Survey

Following the focus groups, a survey was conducted of over 1,500 residents chosen to reflect the population profile of each district.

Aims

- To provide quantitative data to allow priorities to be set for expenditure on different categories of work in the LTP;
- to obtain a view from a representative sample of the population on issues identified by the focus groups;
- to enable a comparison to be made between respondents to the wider Council survey and the representative sample survey.

Methodology

The sample of the residents survey was constructed using the census and Postal Address File (PAF). Fifteen enumeration districts (EDs) were selected at random in each of the five districts (75 EDs in total). These were matched to the PAF to obtain a list of addresses from which the sample of residents could be drawn.

Quotas were set to reflect the profile of the population of each district based on the most recent data available in each authority. Age and gender quotas were based on ONS 1998 mid year estimates for the resident population. Employment status was generally based on Labour Force Survey Local area data. Car ownership for all districts was based on the regional percentages for Yorkshire and the Humberside from 'Regional Trends 1998'. The data obtained was adjusted for under or over achievement of the desired quotas.

The questionnaire was designed to cover:

- travel patterns and choices;
- perceptions of transport issues;
- opinion of transport strategies and measures;
- importance of consultation;
- demographic information.

Results

The fieldwork was carried out between 13 December 1999 and 10 February 2000. A total of 1598 interviews were completed throughout the area and the findings are summarised in Section 4.

3.7 Market Research - Minority Ethnic Groups

Complementary to the main research, focus groups were held with specific sub-groups in the Asian community, followed by in depth interviews with Asian women from low response sub-groups.

Aims

- To reach groups of people whom it was felt would be under-represented when using conventional survey techniques.

Methodology

It was recognised that there were certain sectors of ethnic communities who would not be reached by the methodology described above. Specialist consultants Istikhara Research Ltd. carried out a separate but parallel exercise to redress this balance.

Three focus groups were held comprising the following categories:

- Pakistani women who relied on others to drive them around (14 participants);
- Asian male car drivers (9 participants);
- young Asian males and females who use public transport (8 participants).

In-depth interviews were held with women whom it was felt would be unwilling to attend focus groups. These were:

- 5 interviews with Pataan women;
- 5 interviews with Bengali women;
- 5 interviews with Gujerati women.

The fieldwork was carried out during January and February 2000.

4. SUMMARY OF MAIN CONCLUSIONS

4.1 *Brochure and Internet Website Questionnaire*

An analysis of 2081 completed questionnaires has been carried out. The results are set out in tabular and histogram form in Appendix 2 to this report. The main findings from the analysis are set out below.

Question 2 Transport Issues, perceived level of problem

Respondents were asked to rank transport issues from 'no problem' to being a 'severe problem'. The six issues with the highest proportion rating them as a 'problem' or a 'severe problem' were:

1. traffic congestion in the "rush hour" (84%);
2. congestion/parking around schools (77%);
3. road casualties and traffic danger (72%);
4. air and noise pollution (72%);
5. excessive traffic speeds (67%);
6. quality of bus services (67%).

Question 3 Priorities for addressing transport issues

People were asked to rank a range of eleven transport objectives, giving their top five priorities. Those receiving the highest rankings are listed below, starting with the highest:

1. enable people to get to work, shops and social life (82%);
2. transport infrastructure should be well maintained (72%);
3. alternative modes should be improved to give a wider choice (70%);
4. reduce pollution to improve air quality and health (57%);
5. people should travel safely and without fear (55%);
6. problems encountered by disabled and elderly should be addressed (52%).

Question 4 Acceptability of measures

People were asked to rank a range of ten alternatives for deterring people from using cars for some journeys between acceptable and unacceptable.

Three measures were felt by a majority of respondents to be acceptable or fairly acceptable, namely:

- transfer of road space to bus (73%);
- transfer of road space to pedestrians (72%);
- transfer of road space to cycles (63%).

The other seven measures all received a relatively high percentage of "unacceptable" or "fairly unacceptable" responses, the most unacceptable being:

- increase fuel duty above inflation (72%);
- charge for using motorways (70%);

- charge employees to park at their workplace (65%);
- charge for parking at retail parks (58%).

The following measures were also rated as 'unacceptable' or 'fairly unacceptable' by a smaller majority of respondents:

- cut commuter parking spaces (58%);
- increase commuter parking charge (58%);
- charge cars to enter towns and cities (57%).

It is, perhaps, not surprising that measures that may penalise the private motorist are unpopular. Given the level of support for reducing the level of traffic in some places, it might be argued that people support the ends but not the means by which they may be achievable. Nevertheless, there is some support for these measures with, for example, as many as 40% of respondents finding charges to enter town and city centres to be acceptable or fairly acceptable and 39% thinking likewise about charging for parking at retail parks.

Question 5 Targets

They were also asked whether it was appropriate to set specific targets for a range of issues. The four receiving the most support, in order of popularity, were:

1. reverse the decline in the use of buses (92%);
2. further reduce fatal and serious casualties and halt the increase in slight casualties (89%);
3. get people walking instead of driving for short journeys (86%);
4. reduce the existing levels of traffic in certain places or at certain times (81%).

There was also clear support for the other suggested issues for targets:

- reduce the amount by which traffic is growing each year (75%);
- reduce the number of cars that carry only the driver (63%);
- reduce average vehicle speeds (62%);
- adopt the government's cycling target (double cycle journeys by 2002 and again by 2012) (62%).

Other Comments

In addition to the multiple choice questions, respondents were given the opportunity to make further comments. Subjects covered were many and varied but it has been possible to group them together into subjects with common themes. Some of the most repeated comments are set out in Appendix 3.

Generally, only where there were four or more comments on an issue has it been reported. However, where very few comments were received on a strategy subject, this has been relaxed to ensure that minority views do not go unreported, for example only one comment was received about horses.

There were many instances of opposing views being given, for example in the category of Roads, '*Road building and improvements will exacerbate problems of traffic growth*' (1) contradicts '*More money should be spent on increasing road capacity*' (2) and

'East Leeds Link should be scrapped' (1) contradicts *'Build East Leeds Link Road'* (1). Similar instances can be found in all categories.

4.2 Seminars

COMMENTS FROM INTEREST AND COMMUNITY GROUP SEMINAR 17 APRIL 1999

Policy issues

- Public transport was seen as essential to sustainability.
- Reliability of services and the information about them is paramount.
- A single ticket for through journeys and close location of bus, rail and tram stations with interchange between modes was seen as the ideal to aim for.
- Rail overcrowding is a big disincentive to potential users.
- The standard of rail stations and facilities, other than in the main centres, could be better.
- Trains and buses need to have the same level of convenience and comfort as a private car in order to compete, and the perceived costs must be less.
- Conversely, cars should be made less convenient and slower through traffic restraint.
- Security issues affect the lifestyle of many people, particularly the elderly, young and women travelling alone. Improvements to make a more attractive and safer environment would benefit all travellers, not only those mentioned.
- Pedestrians and cyclists should be treated as real transport modes and given appropriate priority in scheme design.
- Well designed schemes for disabled and sight-impaired pedestrians would attract and encourage more people to walk.
- Road pricing was seen as an opportunity to raise funds for public transport schemes.
- Workplace parking charges should be passed directly to the driver to be effective as a deterrent.
- Planning policy and transport policy should be mutually complementary. Both have a key role in aiding economic development.
- Location of businesses near public transport to reduce need for car ownership and road freight (railways not motorways).
- Maximum parking provision in planning permissions was advocated.
- Parking availability, not price, was thought to be the greater deterrent.
- There was a general feeling against out of town shopping centres and a need to redress the balance towards town centres.
- Pedestrianisation with good PT access was supported.
- Lack of enforcement of traffic orders was referred to as being detrimental to the potential benefits of a good traffic management/bus priority scheme.

Consultation process

- Consultation was welcomed. All were keen to be involved further at a more detailed level and at a more local level.

- Comments of the Integrated Transport Forum on the report of the conference should be sent to all delegates.
- There was a desire expressed by voluntary groups to be involved in the I T Forum in order that they could meet with public transport operators.

COMMENTS FROM BUSINESS CONFERENCE 15 JUNE 1999

- The choice of appropriate locations for development is a major factor in determining future travel patterns.
- In order to attract passengers to public transport, we should concentrate on those who do not use it at present, find out why and take the necessary action to convert them.
- No one mode of transport will suit all purposes and the aim should not be for a complete shift from car use.
- Many tools were identified for employers to encourage a reduction in car commuting and there was a definite willingness for delegates to work together on some issues. Suggestions included car sharing, pool cars, flexible working hours, job swapping and home working. A county wide forum to address Green Travel Plans was mooted.
- It was recognised that Package measures in recent years have achieved positive progress. Areas of concern were the lack of capacity on rail for both passenger and freight demand and publicity and information about bus services.
- The promotion of public transport should be on a more business like basis. The poor image, whether deserved or not, needs changing and education in the wider aspects of transport, including health and safety, should be pursued.
- There is sometimes conflict between providing for economic growth and sustainable transport but with coordination between departments and organisations it was felt that those conflicts could be met.
- The many, often conflicting, demands on transport system providers were noted: town, city, rural needs; business, customers, leisure, commuting; and it was noted that there are never enough funds available to satisfy all demands. The challenge for the Local Transport Plan is to achieve the right balance and apply measures appropriate to each circumstance.
- The revenue costs of transport plan schemes were recognised and new income streams need to be identified. The idea of using income from town centre parking schemes, park and ride, etc. for solutions to transport problems was discussed and thought to be sensible way forward.

INTEREST AND COMMUNITY GROUP SEMINAR 23 OCTOBER 1999

Objectives

- There should be an objective relating to quality of life and social inclusion
- The environment should be given more prominence
- The objective relating to traffic growth should aim to reduce traffic, not the rate of growth. It was agreed that an absolute reduction in traffic could be an ultimate objective of the long-term plan, after stabilisation in the short term.

Priorities of Key Issues

- Improvements to public transport were seen as vital to the success of the Plan,

particularly interchange between bus and rail, through ticketing, smart card ticketing, timetabling and information.

- The priority attached to walking should be raised. A stronger emphasis is needed on development planning, junction design, maintenance, obstructions and the siting of street furniture.
- Land Use Planning should support transport objectives
- Speed reduction was seen as important along with more effective enforcement of speed limits, bus and cycle lanes, parking restrictions, etc. to ensure better traffic management.
- Demand management by way of parking provision and charging, travel plans, road user charging was an important topic, although there was not universal agreement on all issues.

INTEREST AND COMMUNITY GROUPS SEMINAR 15 APRIL 2000

An early draft of the LTP text was sent to delegates to stimulate discussion. The main comments arising from the meeting were:

- There was continued concern about the target for traffic reduction relating to the rate of growth rather than an absolute reduction in traffic numbers
- More priority should be given to enforcement
- There was a lot of discussion about major schemes and concern that there was very little public transport content in the proposals
- A West Yorkshire strategic cycling network should be brought forward in the LTP as a major scheme
- Greater priority should be given to measures to encourage walking
- Bus services should be reliable and regular with a half hourly service as a minimum
- Horseriders, including driven horses, should receive more coverage
- 20mph zones outside schools should be standard
- Green travel should be much more focussed with a commitment to achieving real progress
- There needs to be stronger measures for parking charging and reduction

4.3 Public Meetings

The first aim of the meetings was to address a wider and more localised audience than could be accommodated in the seminars held in Leeds Town Hall. This was achieved by each district meeting with different interest groups, thereby covering a wide range of interests including environmental and women's issues, rights of way, cycling, health, Parish Councils and community groups.

The second aim was to gather views from these local groups, largely for comparison with, and confirmation of, the views of the seminar groups. It was found generally that the same issues and concerns were raised at many of the meetings, albeit sometimes more vociferously by the single interest groups when not tempered by other interests. Participants were encouraged to complete and return the consultation questionnaire.

Issues of a specific local importance were noted, to be addressed by the relevant district when preparing their detailed programme for implementation.

4.4 Market Research – Focus Groups

No separate results were tabulated for the focus groups, as the purpose was to steer the design of the residents survey questionnaire. However, the consultant's report cross refers comments from the focus groups to the survey results.

Issues raised were:

Travel Patterns and Choices

- Car commuters could use another mode but would rather not.
- Reliability of bus and train at peak times
- Peak travel too busy and uncomfortable
- Making connections would increase journey times
- Frequency of early morning and late night buses for workers
- Buses are costly and unsafe for children on journeys to school
- Walking short distances can be quicker if the bus is stuck in traffic
- Safety and pollution deterred many from cycling themselves or allowing their children to cycle to school
- Using a car for shopping trips is much easier than public transport

Perception of Transport Problems

- Few people thought transport problems greatly affected the quality of their day to day lives
- Congestion seen as a main problem, particularly journey times to work and to school
- Buses unreliable due mainly to congestion
- Too much freight on the roads, it adds to congestion and is unsafe in small towns, overnight deliveries suggested
- Out of town shopping centres seen as more convenient and easier than parking in town leading to fear that trade would be taken away from towns

Transport Strategies and Measures

- Road safety was an important issue.
- Speed humps seen as effective in residential areas.
- Raise awareness of potential blackspots and educate children to cross the road safely.
- Measures to reduce car use by increasing motoring costs was deemed unfair.
- Pensioners and disabled people who could not use public transport would not be able to afford to travel about.
- Local businesses were particularly worried about the effect punitive charges would have on their businesses.

- Many felt that increased car use was detrimental to the environment and would like to use their cars less, but not until public transport improves

Consultation and Information

- Local newspapers were thought to be the best way of communicating information
- Many thought public meetings were a waste of time
- Public transport users thought it would be useful to have timetables and route change details on the actual bus services

4.5 Market Research – Residents Survey

Priorities for Transport Strategies

Three quarters of the population were either very much or slightly in favour of the overall aim of the strategy, whilst only 8% were very much or slightly against it.

There was broad agreement that improvements to public transport, measures to reduce speed and improve safety and better facilities for disabled people should receive the highest priority in the strategy. Measures to reduce car travel, either by education and publicity or by active discouragement were ranked lowest priority.

Residents were no more in favour of car restraint measures, such as more expensive car parking, petrol tax or road tolls, in the future than they are now. Only a quarter felt that this was important, even in the future, and the majority (56%) considered it unimportant.

Amongst car users there was a strong feeling that people had a right to choose how they travel (96%) and that it is unfair, in a car orientated society, to expect people to use their cars less (74%). However, the same car users agreed that too much traffic is harming the environment (67%) and traffic congestion is getting so bad (64%) that on both counts they would be prepared to walk, cycle or use public transport for some journeys.

Priorities for Measures

It has been stated above that improvements to public transport are seen as the most important element of the transport strategy. Within that context residents were asked to rank their top four from a list of specific measures to achieve these improvements. The resulting priority order is as below:

1. Cheaper fares
2. More bus lanes and priority to improve their reliability and speed
3. More low access buses for people with children, elderly and disabled
4. Clearer and more readily available bus information
5. Improved comfort on buses, at shelters and bus stations
6. More buses going to more places
7. Bus conductors
8. Through tickets and more pre-paid tickets
9. Improved personal safety on buses and at bus stations
10. Better driver attitudes
11. Better connections with rail services

It is interesting to note that when asked about the least necessary measures, more buses going to more places came top. This suggests that many people feel that the network is adequate and that improvements should focus on the existing network.

Consultation

Residents were asked about the best method of involvement and consultation. Local newspapers and leaflets were clearly favoured by over 50%, with around 10% supporting information on buses or on television. Few people wanted surveys, meetings, information on trains or communication via the Internet.

4.6 Market Research – Ethnic Minorities

The numbers of people taking part in the focus groups and the in-depth surveys were small (see below) and therefore it was not appropriate to tabulate or carry out a statistical analysis of the results to any great extent. The results of the focus groups are presented as a series of individual comments or a consensus view of the group.

Focus group attendance:

- Asian male drivers 9
- Asian young people 8
- Pakistani women 14

In-depth interviews:

- Pataan women 5
- Bengali women 5
- Gujerati women 5

The interview questions were structured in the same format as the main market research study and the comments are set out under the same headings.

Travel Patterns and Choices

Asian male drivers:

- The car was seen as more convenient than other modes of transport and had greater status.
- It gave them flexibility on times of travel and destinations.
- Trains were seen as much faster, efficient and reliable and an option for long distance travel.
- The cost of parking and the inconvenience of driving in the centre of Leeds made the train preferable to the car in that case.
- The cost of using the car if there were several passengers was much cheaper than public transport.

Asian young people:

- Each mode was thought to have advantages in different situations, the speed of trains was particularly highlighted.
- The weather was a big factor in choosing to use public transport. Concern was expressed about untidy appearance at the end of a journey if it is windy and wet.

- For students it was felt that public transport was the only affordable form of transport. Bus stops should be nearer educational establishments for convenience, timekeeping and safety.
- There was also a view that increasing prices would soon make buses in particular non-cost effective.

Pakistani women:

- All the women relied on others, usually family members, to drive them around.
- The women travelled by car, bus or walked. Some occasionally used the train but never bicycle or motorcycle;
- All supermarket shopping trips were made by car, either the family car or taxi;
- The feeling was that a car is a necessity, not a luxury. Improved public transport might encourage some change but the rising cost of public transport meant that the cost of a taxi worked out cheaper for a family.

Perception of Transport Problems

Asian male drivers:

- The transport systems in European countries such as Germany and France were perceived to be better than in UK. Some thought they were free.
- Public transport in Leeds was perceived to be better than in Bradford, but with no foundation other than the relative economic success of Leeds.
- In West Yorkshire the convenience of the car overrides that of public transport compared to London where buses and public transport was the better option.
- Lack of services off peak created a safety problem at bus stops and interchanges, particularly for women, children and lone travellers.
- Several issues about security were of concern: Bradford Interchange was seen as dangerous and intimidating in the evening, security not adequate to deal with large groups of youths, no apparent way of contacting security staff, cameras on buses thought to be for driver's not passengers' security.
- Timetables should be at every bus stop and in larger print as a high proportion of older people use buses.

Asian young people:

- Transport was seen as just as important as other issues such as health and safety.
- The group felt that traffic congestion will be a future problem and transport related problems will increase.
- Buses were perceived as not being reliable.
- Safety and security at bus stations was highlighted; vandalism, drunks in the evening, etc. made them intimidating places.
- Safety on buses was also an issue, drivers did not always follow up disruptive behaviour and verbal abuse, including racism, was common and particularly intimidating for young women.
- There was a lack of understanding of how bus services work; some thought the driver should take a short cut to get to the destination more quickly.

- There was no commitment to use cycles as they were seen as potentially dangerous due to poor car driver behaviour.
- Taxis were not well liked; young people disliked the “small talk” of the drivers, were afraid of the driver’s bona fide, qualifications and ability, wanted a passenger operated brake so they could get out if they felt threatened, thought there should be more white taxi drivers and would rather ask family or neighbours for a lift than use a taxi.

Pakistani women:

- There was a desire for better access for pushchairs on buses without having to fold them.
- Public transport was seen to have greater safety problems than taxis (in contrast to young peoples views above) Waiting for and travelling on buses were both thought to be unsafe at times.
- The distance between bus stops was thought to be too great and cause difficulties for the elderly and infirm.
- Train journey times are much quicker than bus if the option is available;
- Language and cultural barriers prevent some women from using buses. Some had experienced racism and unhelpfulness from bus drivers, others said they did not understand how to buy a ticket etc. and would welcome being shown how.

Consultation and Information

Asian male drivers:

- There is a lack of information about changes to timetables. Leaflets on buses do not reach the casual user.
- Language barriers made the publicity for services and timetables ineffective, particularly amongst elderly Asian people.
- It was felt that it would be difficult to change people’s attitudes away from thinking that the car is easier to use and that public transport is less effective;
- The group thought that advertising would have no effect on attitudes.
- Consultation was seen to be very important, and that the community should be involved in local issues. Community centres, health centres and other local amenities were seen as the best ways to consult.

Asian young people:

- The level of bus information and notification of timetable changes was criticised, not all bus stops had information.
- Consultation was seen as very important, particularly about timetables, routes and other local issues that would affect them directly.
- Young people said they were more likely to use teletext or the internet.

Pakistani women:

- Language was again cited as a major problem - timetables and other information should be in Asian languages.

- Information should be displayed in community centres, supermarkets, doctors' surgeries etc. so that people would not have to go out of their way to plan a journey.

In-depth Interviews

Pataan, Bengali and Gujarati women:

- Only the Gujarati women worked, 3 of them used a car to get to work, the other 2 walked, although one of the drivers occasionally walked.
- 2 of the women travel about on business, one by car, one by bus.
- 4 travel to school/college, 3 by car, one walks.
- 9 women accompany their children to school, 3 by car, 6 walking.
- Various forms of transport were used for shopping at different times depending on the nature of the purchases to be made. The responses indicated 11 go by car, 9 walk, 6 use the bus, 2 taxi and one cycles.

Similar issues arose in the interviews as in the focus groups. These can be summarised as:

- Language and cultural barriers.
- Public transport unreliability/punctuality.
- Public transport high fares.
- Make walking safer, e.g. better lighting and CCTV.
- More traffic calming, speed reduction, road safety measures.
- Benches on pedestrian routes to allow the less physically able to rest on the way to local amenities.
- Increasing charges on cars was not popular as many depended on the car for cultural reasons.
- All wanted to be consulted about local transport issues and thought community centres and medical practises were the best way of doing this.

5. ACTION TAKEN WITH RESPECT TO CONSULTATION SUGGESTIONS

Many of the comments received are addressed in the LTP as part of the "menu" of measures available to the partners when detailed implementation programmes are being prepared. For example, we know that the presentation of timetable information, and its provision at every bus stop, is important to many people. We know that public transport reliability and frequency are factors that will attract more people to use buses and trains more often. We know that there is a general feeling against measures that make life more difficult or more expensive for the private motorist, although these become more acceptable with a good public transport alternative in place.

None of these are groundbreaking revelations, but they do reinforce, and in some cases correct, the authorities' perceptions of what people want from a public transport system. Some views are contradictory and mutually exclusive and the challenge is to satisfy, as far as possible as many transport needs as possible without seriously disadvantaging one group in order to benefit another. The LTP partners now have a broader understanding of the inter-relationship between the needs of different groups of people and it is hoped, through the process of public participation, that the different user groups

will better understand each other's needs.

Key specific messages relating to objectives and overall strategic approach, and the actions taken in response, are summarised in Table 1.

| Comment | Respondent(s) | Action Taken |
|--|---|---|
| Objectives | | |
| Environmental and social objectives should be given more priority | Interest and Community Group Seminar | Objectives have been revised and presentation amended to clarify equal status of objectives. |
| Road traffic reduction should be a fundamental objective of the Plan | Friends of the Earth and other environmental groups | The objective has been amended, but not to the extent sought by some respondents A key target is to prevent traffic growth across the Leeds cordon. |
| Strategic Approach | | |
| The West Yorkshire Authorities should adopt a road user hierarchy. | Friends of the Earth and other environmental groups | An order of consideration is proposed for formal adoption |
| The plan should include proposals for a West Yorkshire cycle network. | Cycling groups | The development of cycling networks is proposed |
| Transport infrastructure should be well maintained | Brochure questionnaire respondents | Maintenance is given a high priority within the Plan programme. |
| Some charging measures (e.g. charging for workplace parking or motorway use) would be unacceptable | Brochure questionnaire respondents Market research | Such charges are not proposed. |
| There should be better facilities for disabled people | Brochure questionnaire respondents | The Plan places considerable emphasis on improving the accessibility of the transport system. |
| More priority should be given to enforcement | Interest and Community Group Seminar | Ongoing discussions are being held with the Police regarding enforcement. The Plan includes provision for investment in camera technology to aid enforcement. |
| Greater priority should be given to measures to encourage walking | Interest and Community Group Seminar | Pedestrians are placed at the top of the hierarchy of consideration. Greater expenditure is proposed on measures to assist pedestrians. |

Table 1: Summary of Consultation Responses and Actions

We recognise the importance of public consultation and participation in scheme development and implementation and are developing models to ensure good practice throughout the Plan period. This will include further and continuing involvement with the interest and community group representatives who have already contributed so enthusiastically towards the development of the Plan. The debate will continue over the broader issues of priorities and objectives in that forum.

Consultation will also continue at district level over the detailed content of programmes and on individual schemes as they affect local communities.